

ADULT EDUCATION IN A WORLD OF EXCESSIVE RICHES/EXCESSIVE POVERTY

Talk (or portions) delivered by John Ohliger during September/October 1982 for the University of British Columbia, Athabasca University, University of Alberta Extension, University of Calgary, Ramah-Navajo School Board (New Mexico), and University of Wyoming. Grateful thanks to Duncan Campbell for making research and preparation possible and the following persons for helpful comments on the first draft: Jerry Apps, Dan Beveridge, Richard Bonokoski, Roger Boshier, Sam Brightman, Mike Collins, Web Cotton, Reva Crawford, Michael Day, Anne Fitzgerald, Ron Gross, Sudie Hofmann, Phil Kaveny, Dave Lisman, Art Lloyd, Michael Marien, John Minnis, John Niemi, Judy Nordness, Helen Parris, Carol Peterson, Hayden Roberts, Tim Turner, Cathy Lumer, Chris Wagner, David C. Williams, and Michael Wyatt.

In Kurt Vonnegut's novel, God Bless You, Mr. Rosewater, Eliot Rosewater, the heir to the 14th largest family fortune in America, talks about a generally unrecognized but major form of adult education: "Our family was born on the banks of Money River, where the wealth of the nation flows. We can slurp from the mighty river to our hearts' content. And we even take slurping lessons, so we can slurp more efficiently. Slurping lessons from lawyers! From tax consultants! From customers men! We're born close enough to the river to drown ourselves and the next ten generations in wealth, simply using dippers and buckets. But we still hire the experts to teach us the use of aqueducts, dams, reservoirs, siphons, bucket brigades, and the Archimedes' screw. And our teachers in turn become rich, and their children become buyers of lessons in slurping." [1] (See references at end of text.)

I. [2] "Michael Harrington in his seminal book, The Other America [3], suggested that there were really two Americas and that these two societies, one rich the other poor, were rapidly growing apart. . . There may be two adult education worlds and these two worlds are growing farther and farther apart. There is one world of adult education in which the central ideas are institutions, 'professionalism,' and technology. In this world key words are credit, credentialing, accreditation, turf, input-output, needs assessment, and credit hours generated. In the other world of adult education, learners, empowerment and democratization are central ideas. Key words in the world are autonomous learner, community-based, participatory research, appropriate technology, independent scholarship, voluntarism, learning exchanges, (and) deprofessionalization." [4]

All of the above are the words of Professor Phyllis Cunningham, Head of the Graduate Adult Education Program at Northern Illinois University. She wrote them a few months ago as a part of an introduction to Compass: A Resource Directory just published by the National Alliance for Voluntary Learning. It's striking how Phyllis Cunningham's two worlds of adult education line up with the two dominant visions of a possible future Post-Industrial Society as noted by Michael Marien, an adult educator who edits Future Survey. [5] After Marien examined hundreds of "future studies" books, documents, and articles, he concluded that one of the two main views of Post-Industrial Society is that it could be a technological, top-down service society seeing the "good life" as affluence and leisure with high-tech big technology solving problems which lead to mastery of the environment. The second view seeks an ecological,

decentralized society. The "good life" in the second is useful work, peace, self-fulfillment, and appropriate technology leading to harmony with the environment. And Marien believes the adult learning approaches of these contrasting visions of the future closely parallel Phyllis Cunningham's two worlds of adult education. [6]

As do Phyllis Cunningham and Michael Marien, I live in both of these worlds of adult education and interact daily with people who have the two contrasting visions of the future. Certainly some of the field of adult education falls between the cracks of these worlds and visions. However, the historical context for an overarching view was set forth some 60 years ago by the great British historian and adult educator, R.H. Tawney. In 1920 Tawney looked about him and inside himself and asked what we first consider when we want to help people through adult education or any other social activity. He concluded that often when "people are touched by social compunction, they can think of nothing more original than the diminution of poverty, because poverty, being the opposite of riches which they value most, seems to them the most terrible of human afflictions. They do not understand that poverty is a symptom and a consequence of social disorder, while the disorder itself is something at once more fundamental and more incorrigible. And they do not understand that the quality in their social life which causes it to demoralize a few by excessive riches, is also the quality which causes it to demoralize the many by excessive poverty." [7]

I'm proud to be a part of adult education and have been since I started practicing it in the mid-1940s. But as I see it some of the quality that Tawney bemoaned is found in the rigid over-emphasis at present on certain types of adult education. Yes, even on the belief that education itself is a panacea for most of the world's ills, that education is "the greatest thing since sliced bread," especially since much of the world doesn't have and wouldn't benefit from sliced bread. In this talk the order is going to be more chronological than logical. I will try to connect some of my personal experiences [8] to some of the tough issues that bedevil us as we seek to get beyond the baleful quality that Tawney noted: professionalism; competence; accountability; the compulsory education of adults or mandatory continuing education - MCE; science, scientism, and technology; techniques in adult education; graduate programs; and the meaning of knowledge.

For convenience I'm going to label the two worlds that Phyllis and Michael laid out. The first I'll call Orthodox, Standard Brand, Establishment, or Top-Down Institutional. The second Alternative, Mutual Learner Centered, or MLC for short. Just plain Learner Centered is an attractive but dangerous label because in standard adult ed jargon within large institutions, Learner Centered often comes out in practice like an elephant centering on a mouse. Obviously, my heart is with the world of Mutual Learner Centered - MLC, but it's important to recognize that any notion of opposites like the two world views is at best incomplete. It's vital to see them as two different perspectives joined together in the all encompassing circle of daily life. It's not a win-lose situation, or a zero-sum game. And the future will undoubtedly be somewhat different than any of us envision it. No Orthodox adult ed program could exist without some MLC activity, and the world of MLC is impossible without some institutional structure. So it's worthwhile to see the two different worlds as areas of emphasis, often in conflict but sometimes in dialogue. Even though they are growing farther apart, they are certainly still related to each other in many ways.

II. *I was introduced to the prospect of living in and between two different worlds at a very young age. Though I was born in the United States, when I was six months old, the family moved to Canada, where we stayed til I was five. Once in a while when I've spoken in Canada, the person introducing me has said that I'm Canadian in the Freudian sense, since I spent what are called the "formative" years in Canada. Whenever I hear the Freudian label applied, I think of the murky medical world of the id, the ego and the superego, and of the need for tender treatment at the hands of a physician through psycho-analysis. I felt similarly about the Orthodox world until recently when we received a letter at Basic Choices from Bruce Woll in Chicago. [9]*

III. Bruce wrote, "The March 1st issue of The New Yorker [10] contains a remarkable example of professionalism and science issuing in distortion, misrepresentation, and obfuscation. Bruno Bettelheim in his essay of Freud there documents this in one telling instance after another." For example, Freud never used the Greek terms id, ego or superego but the common German words for The It, The I, and the Above-I. "Freud held that psycho-analysis should not exist solely within a medical framework. He did not understand psycho-analysts to be 'purveyors of an esoteric or revealed truth.'" But in their desire to keep Freud strictly within the confines of conventional, scientific medicine, the American analysts took the position that psycho-analysis must be restricted to physicians and to this end introduced a bill into the New York State Legislature in 1926, which declared illegal any analysis not conducted by a physician.

That was in 1926. By 1982, the professional medical model linked with conventional science reaches such an extreme that a large U.S. corporation operating a number of hospitals issues its annual report with this happy statement. "Today's pressured life style and the breakdown of traditional family values ensures a continuing rise in drug abuse and emotional problems, so that we have the opportunity to grow in revenues and earnings beyond the fondest dreams of most managements." [11] It's at least a small comfort that Orthodox adult education has not quite reached that point, but it's coming close with its constant emphasis on increased revenues from larger student enrollments. Large scale adult ed draws much of its ideology from the same close linking of professionalism and conventional science, dependent as it has been on both these influences from the academy and medical model. But as critical as I am of professionalism and conventional science or scientism, they both started out historically as laudable attempts to improve the world and our lives in it. Professionalism, for instance, appeared first in the modern world as, among other things, an attempt on the part of academics to free themselves from the rigid control of dictatorial college presidents and the narrow theology of denominational colleges. [12] But it wasn't too long before the academics themselves were presiding over universities that had as one of their main goals the preparation of professionals for careers that were not yet even remotely considered professions, including adult education. [13]

IV. *Our family moved back from Canada to the United States when I was five years old. I discovered just recently when typing my 86 year old mother's memoirs that the move was at her insistence. Later when my father found a job in Toronto she declined to move there, and he returned to the family in Detroit. My mother's insistence may have simply stemmed from a feeling that I've begun to identify with in recent years. - the desire to be a part of the place where her roots were. We live in a world in which increasingly the mass media and their corporate-bureaucratic allies [14] are weakening "almost every form of spontaneous association." But that*

"does not destroy the desire for association. Uprootedness uproots everything except the need for roots." [15] I remember when I was an early adolescent being pushed into thinking and deciding what I wanted to "be" when I grew up. There is no more questionable question for a so-called child than "What do you want to be when you grow up?" UNESCO adult educators and others continue to push "Learning to Be," when we already "are," and need no educational program to legitimize our existence. [16] I vacillated about the teacher's insistent question for weeks, then presented a paper in class saying that I wanted to be an entomologist, an expert in insects, even though I was afraid of bugs. I think it was because I wanted to reject the question by picking some career as unique and obscure as possible. A few years later when I settled on the label "adult educator" for myself, it too was then relatively unique and definitely obscure.

V. How many of you recall in years past telling someone you were an adult educator and getting back the question, "Just what is it you do?" No one these days has any doubt there is such a field, but in earlier days the label produced some strange reactions or some stereotyped response, like, "Oh! You must teach Night School," something I never did. Now, according to some authorities, adult or continuing education is the fastest growing area in education and uses more dollars than all other types combined. [17] If adult ed is such a big and growing field, why are so many of us so insecure? Taking into account that everyone feels insecure these days in a world that seems on the brink of blowing itself up, there must be more to it than that. The closest I've been able to come is that adulthood itself is believed to be a part of life relatively free from educational or schooling constraints, at least that's the myth we've all grown up with as we looked forward to getting out of school into the "real" world. Just a few years ago, the present Governor of Minnesota said that if children thought they would have to go to school all their lives they would immediately rebel. [18] To be the agent of the establishment for telling people they ought to go to school as adults is a tough and vulnerable job, to say the very least. Even adopting the more lofty label "continuing education" doesn't help very much, because it implies for many continuing the work of schooling or university life, at a time when these institutions are coming under increasing criticism. It is a relief to find out that at least some of the criticism of this huge Orthodox adult ed world originates from within the field. Witness an article in the New York Times just a month ago by the Acting Dean of Continuing Education at New York University with the provocative title, "Adult Education: Breeder of Inequality?" [19]

Some of the criticism from within the field confronts the increasing emphasis these days on "competence." No human being likes to be told, "You're incompetent, and you have to go back to school to remove your deficiencies." I don't recall wanting to be an adult educator to help remove peoples' "deficiencies" and make them certifiably "competent." It seems to me that the work of the adult educator has more to do with assuring people that they already are competent -- competent, no matter what their station or background to raise questions about their own personal lives in these environments and to join together with others to do something about changing themselves and the world for the better. Such change certainly requires competence. But it is not the competitive competence that the Establishment endorses. It has more to do with effectiveness -- mutual, caring and cooperative effectiveness.

Preparing for this talk I used some high technology, and had a computer search run of the over 400,000 documents in ERIC, the educational research depository of the U.S. Department of Education. For the word "competence" and its closely linked concept "accountability" the search

indicated that almost five percent of the documents dealt with these currently fashionable terms - well over 20,000. [20] We narrowed the search down to a more manageable 100 or so by limiting the search to those dealing with professionals and continuing education. From these documents and other sources, we found that the authors agree on only one thing: There is no precise agreement, either on what competence is, or on how to determine it. [21] Most authors called for more research, while keeping the pressure on people to achieve the undefined competent state.

There is a division between those who would broadly define competence as a capacity to perform and those who would limit it to measured good performance. Those of us who would characterize all adults as having the capacity to do good work are one down to those with greater power who deny such democratic beliefs and narrowly define competence as exhibited only when measured behaviorally. But even those who surrender to the need for measured competent performance in order to meet demands for something called "accountability," express certain cautions. They point to the potential high social costs of pressing harder and harder for such measurements. One of these high costs may well be the delegitimization of any educational institution which pursues a broad social mission, liberal arts or humanities, for instance. Another related social cost deals with what the emphasis on continued competence through continuing education may reveal. If too much pressure is applied for continuing competence, it soon becomes evident that original competence may not have been assured by the training program which claimed the power to certify the uncertifiable -- that a person has completed a sufficient period of introductory study.

Part of the problem of defining competence lies in the general understanding that it should include more than mere technical competence -- mere certified skill in performing some difficult manipulative task or some set of them, for instance. Competence always includes some concepts of personal and social morality -- many authors call them "attitudes." The competent professional is assumed to be the caring professional. But as J. Roby Kidd pointed out in Calgary in 1980, and as others have noted elsewhere, this is often not a correct assumption. [22] For sure, the hidden curriculum of many large institutions inculcates certain types of morality. But the morality usually turns out to be a type of loyalty to narrow institutional goals. In some industrial situations, this loyalty is often the willingness to get to work on time, not to leave the job early, and to steal too much from the employer.

The apparent public demand for competence and accountability is an indication of growing awareness about what actually goes on in educational institutions. When higher education was confined in earlier days to a small number of professionals -- doctors, lawyers, etc. -- those without higher education tended to look with awe at them and assume those having higher schooling had reached some lofty plateau of both knowledge and morality. [23] But as more and more people went through college, they looked back on their own college life and realized its real but limited value. They began to question their previous uncritical acceptance of professional expertise. The farmer who told the agricultural extension agent, "Thanks for your advice, but I already know how to farm far better than I'm doing it," is an example. We could be living through not a crisis of competence, as we are often told, but a crisis of moral effectiveness.

VI. My first experience as an adult educator was in the mid-1940s in Germany when I was part of the U.S. Army of Occupation there. I taught radio Morse code to other soldiers. Our small group was stationed in the stables of a 15th century castle at Schloss Schwarzenberg near Nuremberg. We all worked together well in the classes in the small requisitioned school house near the castle. I remember best the playful snowball fight we had one day with some children who attended the school when it was theirs. The problem was that I was also the noncommissioned officer in charge of the soldier's lives outside of the classroom. That didn't work out so well. We all lived together and I remember how sad I was when I came back to the stables one night to find that the soldiers had mistreated the little puppy that I had adopted.

VII. I have slowly learned in the years how difficult it is to be in command of the students we are educating. Command is very difficult to avoid in the Orthodox world. A friend of mine once taught a course at a university in the most egalitarian manner possible, but he was also responsible for grading his students. He told me about a dream one of his students had and reported to him. The student dreamed that the whole class was playing basketball together. All was going well, except that my friend, the professor, was in the dream at the same time a player and the referee. [24] A tough spot to be in, but I know of few people who handle it well.

VIII. My second experience as an adult educator was a year or so later in Germany when I was the sergeant responsible for the company's Troop Information and Education Program. We had frequent current affairs discussions which I led. I also expressed some strong opinions during the discussions. Here the problem was that the soldiers were required to attend. It never even occurred to me that there was anything wrong with that. But I still have this vivid memory of what happened a little later as I prepared to leave Germany in 1948 after completing my "hitch" in the Regular Army. The grizzled old sergeant-major who ran our company, but had also been required to join in the discussions, handed me a box of matches and said wryly, "Here, now you can go out and set the world on fire!"

IX. How I wish that I knew then what I know now due to the recent efforts of Roger Boshier at the University of British Columbia. Roger had just completed an historical study about some courageous opposition to mandatory continuing education - MCE - in the New Zealand Army during the First World War. [25] What Roger's study points to for me is the possibility of a somewhat neglected form of adult learning -- adult education by example. Although those who opposed MCE in the New Zealand Army may have ultimately failed in their efforts, they offered an example to others of the importance of standing up for worthwhile values in a tough situation. As far as I know no adult education text deals with this approach, no graduate course covers it. But it is potentially one of the most important forms available. Exemplary personal and group action as a learning stimulus to others offers some of the rare hope for a good future. But it also opens up the hazardous domain of heroes, heroines, saints, and martyrs. Blindly following them is dangerous and foolish, however virtuous they may be. Courageous good action can be a worthwhile form of human questioning on the part of otherwise ordinary people. Their example can be an occasion for learning by others - for pondering the meaning of their action for our own lives. [26]

X. When I returned to the United States from Germany, I completed my first degree at Wayne University in Detroit. In was able to complete it in less than three years because the universities

then permitted returning GIs to take tests of general knowledge and skip some of the required courses. I was one of the last veterans allowed to do that. Today "credit for experience" is considered a daring experiment. Besides attending the university, I became active in the local Democratic Party. My most vivid recollection of that time is shaking from fear one night hiding behind an auto and peering out into the dark. My assignment from the liberal forces in the Democratic Party was to help gather evidence that Jimmy Hoffa and his henchmen in the Teamster's Union were inside the apartment I was spying on, forging petitions to get their conservative friends on the ballot. Due to our efforts, and the fact that quite a few of the signatures on the petitions were of voters who had died or moved away, we proved the forgeries. But the local Democratic Party leaders caved in, because of pressure from higher-ups, and let the petitions stand. That was a crucial incident in my own personal adult education. We often talk about how crises provide the occasion for the helpful challenge of a learning experience. A common illustration is the cartoon where the wife answers the phone while the husband lies on the couch nearby with his arms and legs in splints. The wife says, "I'm sorry George can't come to the phone right now. He just had a learning experience driving on the freeway." But if such an experience calls forth significant learning, it is usually the result of a chain of experiences which peak at a certain moment but are not just contained in it. In the Army I had lived with many persons -- ordinary GIs not officers - who were not considered "leadership" materials. Yet they were just as capable of running their own affairs and making decisions as the officers who commanded them. I was slowly reaching the belief that real small-d democracy was possible. At the time of the incident with the Democratic Party leaders over Hoffa, I had been reading about democratic socialism in the writings of George Orwell and others. Orwell's novel, 1984, had just been published with the obvious lesson that unless common people began to run their own lives, we would all be doomed by the year 1984. [27] The incident clinched it. I soon left my volunteer Democratic Party post and sought out colleagues - or comrades as we called each other then - in political activities that fit more with our hopes for a fair and free society. My comrades and I had plenty of time to practice our mutual moral stance in peace marches, demonstrations, picketing and other work. But we also recognized that the goal of true political and economic democracy would be a long time coming. It seemed to me that adult education offered one modest path among many toward reaching that goal.

XI. My first paid civilian job in adult ed was in the early 1950s with the labor education department of the Michigan Congress of Industrial Organizations -- The CIO. I ran a little portable book store. We used to take boxes of books around to conferences and conventions. Our motto was TAKE A BOOK TO BED FOR A CHANGE! I also taught speech classes to local union members. My approach was simply to encourage the members to get up and talk about what interested them. The whole class would then discuss what they heard. Other classes were being taught with the popular Dale Carnegie techniques. This was my first brush as a teacher with the use of snappy techniques. When all the classes met together for a "graduation" dinner, the students in the Dale Carnegie classes gave very brisk, well-ordered talks. My students talked briefly and rambled a little. But they came off as much more sincere and convincing even without knowledge of a bunch of sophisticated techniques for persuasion - for selling their points of view like a commodity.

XII. Today the literature of adult ed is filled with advice on the latest techniques, not only for teaching, but for recruiting students, keeping them, and evaluating them. Most of this

literature assumes the basic value of the current political system. The acquisition of just a few more technical procedures will improve the efficiency of that system. When people like Paulo Freire or Ivan Illich come along with strong social criticism accompanied by educational suggestions for helping folks change the system, what do you think happens? Their suggestions are often separated from their criticisms and reduced to manageable techniques for improving the status quo. Roby Kidd's son, Ross, has recently co-authored an excellent article pointing out the frequent co-optation of Freire's approach. [28] Illich found some drastic ways of dealing with the problem, including turning his back on some of his earlier suggestions. At one time Monsignor Illich said, "I want to live in education up to, and in, the moment of my death." But he was so dismayed by what use was made of his ideas that he began to critically examine the history of the term "education" itself. Some years ago, after he had begun to do this, I was riding in the back seat of an auto with Ivan in the front seat. I defended the importance of the concept "education" and pointed out that "to educate" could mean to draw someone out. Ivan turned to me in the back seat, made a playful quick motion toward my pants as if he were going to pull out my genitals and cut them off. Then he said, "That's what education is really aimed at drawing out!" I still believe that "education" is a worthwhile concept but think we should pay serious attention to Illich's criticism of it. [29]

XIII. My biggest failure in the CIO days was while teaching a speech class to union members across the Detroit River in Canada. The class wanted me to teach them Parliamentary Procedure techniques so they could outmaneuver the dedicated Communist Party members in their ranks. I didn't know much about Parliamentary Procedure, so I felt very inferior and chickened out. But I did learn later that all the Robert's Rules of Order in the world would not have helped them if they didn't have the votes and didn't have members as dedicated as the Communists were. Often the Communists won simply by prolonging the meetings and staying to the bitter end, while others drifted away. It was dedication and militancy more than techniques that kept the Communists in unfair minority control of some unions until they were driven out by even more unfair red-baiting tactics.

XIV. It is often said that without knowledge of the proper techniques, adult educators are condemned to dilettantish and ineffective amateurism. Everyone affirms the importance of a job well done. But the techniques themselves just cannot be separated from the social milieu in which they are learned. Many adult education professors teach techniques through a system of lectures and other didactic procedures that are the direct opposite of what is being presented as a democratic approach to learning. It's tempting but inappropriate to cry "hypocrite" when this is done. Most professor of adult education are sincere about their teaching and are no more hypocritical than the average person. I think the problem goes much deeper and has to do with how we see knowledge. In fact, seeing knowledge may be precisely the problem. Knowledge, in common parlance and in the loftiest reaches of philosophy, is something that is metaphorically seen. We often describe the knowing process as enlightenment. We call ignorance "living in darkness." Mort Gordon, the former head of the graduate adult education program at the University of Michigan, says universities should be "Temples of Light." In everyday language, we "see the light" when we discover some truth or perceive some reality. In cartoons, a light bulb goes on over the head of a character who gets an idea. So we may feel that if we can only get our students to attain something called "insight" about a technique, they will be able to apply it in a situation entirely different from the classroom where it was taught. It may be the

overemphasis on this form of knowledge that's the problem. Perhaps we should consider other ways of thinking about it. Some philosophers of liberation are claiming that in the Third World, truth, being reality, are not considered something to be seen. They are not a light in the window of existence. "The nomad and the shepherd experience being as proximity, face-to-face. Being is not expressed as clarity but neighborliness. Among classical philosophers, the world was considered to be that which is seen, thought, controlled. If instead, spatiality is given priority, proximity becomes the criterion of reality and freedom provides the categories. Praxis then means to simply shorten the distance." [30] This Third World approach calls into question the overemphasis we have placed on words, ideas, and intellect to the detriment of feelings, experience, and personal human relationships.

These different ways of dealing with reality, truth, and knowledge may be what is at the heart of Phyllis Cunningham's statement at the beginning of this talk that the two worlds of adult education - Orthodox and the Mutual Learner Centered - are moving farther and farther apart. Orthodox adult educators continue to focus on knowledge as illumination. Without rejecting that approach, alternate adult educators balance it with an emphasis on community and face-to-face mutual concern. They may be developing a conception of knowledge as what goes on when people are close to each other and support each other in the day-to-day struggles and joys of their existence.

XV. After I worked with the CIO labor education department for a year or so, my mentor, the great Bill Kimsley, left to take a position with the International Confederation of Free Trade Unions. [31] And I left to take a series of jobs in factories in Detroit. I began to experience for the first time the life on the assembly line of the men and women I had been teaching speech and selling labor books to. When life soured in Detroit, I took a bus for Los Angeles where I also worked in factories for a while. Then I connected with the liberal arts discussion programs funded by the undistributed wages for the workers I had been teaching. One of the large auto companies, Ford Motors, had set up the Fund for Adult Education which supported the discussion programs and other adult ed activities. For the next several years, I lived mainly on the charity of the Ford Fund in various programs and as a scholarship student in the graduate adult ed program at UCLA. Eventually I received a masters degree after studying with Paul Sheats and Abbott Kaplan. [32] I soon went East to the University of Chicago to start the doctoral program with Cy Houle and work with such discussion programs as the Great Books which Houle had been instrumental in founding.

XVI. In those days there was what would now be looked at as a naïve faith that if people could just be exposed to the great thoughts of the classics, through discussion they would see ways to apply these ideas to the problems of modern society. But the importance of collective action and the vital place of personal and group feelings were generally ignored. Ford money had been crucial also in the organization in the early 1950s of the Adult Education Association, the umbrella group in the United States. The literature as seen in the AEA's popular magazine, Adult Leadership, was sprinkled with the same kind of liberal ideology that prevailed in the administration of the discussion programs. It may have been the withdrawal of Ford funding in the late 50s that began to turn thoughts of people like Houle, Malcolm Knowles, the first head of the AEA, and Coolie Verner, a prominent professor of adult education, toward another path. They began to consider the need for some kind of professional structure for the field to

strengthen the best work for what may have appeared as the long dark night ahead. I've never been able to figure out what really turned them in that direction of professionalism besides the general social pressure for it.

But one thing is clear. At the beginning at least, the desire for professional status in adult education was still imbued with some kind of shining social purpose -- as vague as it might have been. Though professionalism has turned out to be irrelevant to the social and personal concerns of the 80s, in those dark 50s and early 60s, it may have looked like the saving grace. It might not only end the marginal status of the field but make it possible for adult educators to do really good work in secure surroundings. In the mid-70s, I sensed a whiff of this hope and faith turned sour by the years after the early 60s in a letter Coolie Verner wrote me: "I'm glad that I am approaching retirement and can leave our field and profession," Coolie stated. "Heretofore I've never doubted the validity and viability of either but now I begin to wonder if it was all worthwhile. Too many people have become academics in adult education without any real commitment to it or any sense of responsibility to the development of the discipline or the profession. We are not just another arm of an already obsolete educational system but the new members seek to make us that. Adult education cannot become a viable alternative to a decadent educational system when those in it see it only as an extension of that system, rather than as a unique opportunity to create a new learning alternative. I know that I am *persona non grata* for these views and that's why I shall be glad to get out. Someone else can fight the good fight." [33]

People like Verner, and even more Houle and Knowles, seem to have such great respect for the importance of prudence and caution about their personal lives that it's very difficult to understand their underlying motivations. But recently I've been reading the works of one of the all-time greats in adult education, R.H. Tawney, which may provide some clues to what undergirded the desire for professional status among some of the American leaders. All of them were familiar with his writings, I believe, and had great respect for his views. Tawney was a leader in the British Worker's Educational Association most of his life. He is best known for his book, Religion and the Rise of Capitalism. [34] But it is an earlier work, The Acquisitive Society, that presents the only laudable theory of professional goals I've ever encountered. [35] In this book Tawney proposed the professionalization of industry. That we have come closer to the industrialization of the professions surely has him spinning in his grave. As Tawney looked about himself in England in the first decades of this century, he saw the emerging modern professions - medicine and teaching, for instance - offering a modest but worthwhile model. He believed that society was then without a function. Profit and the acquisition of property were not, in his view, goals worthy of the name. What he hoped for was a society where professional work offered that function. For him "the distinguishing feature of a profession" was the "collective liability for the maintenance of a certain quality of service." He hoped that all workers would become professionals, proud of their crafts. Tawney called for a professional ethos for just about everyone except finance capitalists. His was not the selfish goal of setting out some turf like adult education and then denying the term professional to those who don't go through some rigid training program and fit some arcane model. He believed that such a proposal for professional work would operate well only if what he called "functionless property" (e.g. rent from urban land) was abolished, if there was no secrecy, and if there was significant measure of worker control subject to democratic supervision. Professional work would provide a

helpful matrix for society if somehow all those who did such work could be "free from the vulgar subordination of moral standards to financial interests." If, as I believe, many today have avoided the recognition of such subordination only by putting blinders over their eyes, then the dilemma of those who would professionalize is clear. Figure out a way to take off those blinders without being cast off into the oblivion of eccentricity or the damnation of the label "subversive." A very tough dilemma. [36]

XVII. During the year that I studied with Houle in the late 50s at the University of Chicago, I had one of the best experiences of my graduate study life and some of the worst. The best was a once a week seminar that Houle turned over to a group of students to run. Adult educators and others met with us through the attraction of Houle's sponsorship, and they sparked some of the most fruitful discussions I've ever participated in. The worst experiences resulted from Houle's unwillingness to engage his students in gut-level discussions and our inability to get him to be frank with us. [37] In 1960 I returned to California where I worked in alternative adult educational broadcasting and then helped administer the large Peace Corps Training Program at UCLA.

XVIII. It was at UCLA that I encountered a professor of adult education who offers a model, if we must have one, for graduate study. His name is Wat Dickerman. Others who studied with him will confirm this high appraisal. For instance, John Niemi at Northern Illinois University or Web Cotton and Ira Winn, professors in the California State University system. [38] Wat is now retired but when he headed the grad program at UCLA he nurtured us all in his easy-going relaxed way. He encouraged discussion in all his classes with a difference. When he saw us wandering off the track he had the rare ability to tell us gently to shut up and start over again. One thing that Wat emphasized was that you should find out what interested you most before embarking on a paper or a dissertation. If you didn't pursue your strongest interest, he cautioned, you would find it harder and harder going the closer you came to the end. Any lengthy project becomes a chore after a while, so find one you really like. I think of Wat whenever I encounter students who say that their professors won't let them pursue their serious interests. The student who told me he wanted to do a dissertation on racial discrimination in adult education, for instance, or the one who wanted to look into the curse of sexism in the field.

XIX. As I was finishing my doctorate at UCLA in the mid-60s, I ran across a classified ad for an adult education position in, of all places, the popular magazine, Saturday Review. It was placed there by Gordon Campbell who was seeking faculty and staff for the first regional community college in British Columbia. I became the first director of Continuing Education at Selkirk College. It was an exciting and frustrating year. We accomplished quite a bit in the communities near the college, but a few months after the college opened its doors, Gordon resigned as Principal. [39] Within a year many of the other faculty and administrators, including me, also left. Gordon had created a college built on the dream of true community involvement, but his board wanted it to be primarily an extension of high school. [40]

XX. Besides working with Gordon Campbell, an inspiring person, the most fulfilling part of the year for me at Selkirk College was learning what adult education at its best is all about from Buddy DeVito, a member of the college board. [41] Buddy made his living repairing shoes and had comparatively little schooling. He was probably put on the board because he was an

important political figure. Not long after, he was elected Mayor. But as he worked in his father's shoe repair shop, he practiced the kind of informal adult education that sets the framework for the best in the field. Buddy did not teach, he did not preach. Mainly he listened and conversed. When people came to get their shoes fixed, they talked with him about their problems and those of the community. Buddy worked with them very informally to gather the collective strength to do something about these problems. And he learned along with them about how to make things better. Of course, formal study has its place, but it should draw its inspiration from the natural settings in which learning occurs. If you would like to find out more about how informal adult education can go on in surroundings like a shoe repair shop, then read Frank Adams' account of how he did the same in Ron Gross' book Invitation to Lifelong Learning. [42]

XXI. When I left Selkirk College, I joined the faculty of the graduate adult ed program at Ohio State University. In my seven years as a professor there, the split between the Orthodox and Mutual Learner Centered worlds of adult ed became evident. And I learned that some of the words I had uncritically absorbed in the standard texts at the University of Chicago and UCLA were just that - words. We had been told again and again that whatever the Orthodox world of adult ed was, it was voluntary.

XXII. Adults did not have to enroll in classes. They were also free to leave them if they didn't like them. I justified my participation in Standard Brand adult ed on that basis - at least people were not forced to take all those courses. I soon learned that this was not true for many millions of adults and becoming less true every day. Sad to say, without the opposition of most leaders of adult education. More and more adults were being pressured into or required to enroll in courses, to get involved in a group that provided "educational therapy," or to unwillingly learn in factory of office jobs to do things that were contrary to all human values.

Why has the rhetoric of voluntary participation been so strong in adult education? It is still strong, only these days more confined to something called "volunteerism," a euphemism for getting involved in complex services to established institutions for little or no pay. Volunteering used to mean involvement in social change activities, but it has little of that implication today. [44] I have an idea why the word "voluntary" or "volunteer" is so strong in adult ed jargon. When adult ed started as a discrete field in North America in the 1920s it brought together two quite disparate groups of people. First, there were the adult educators who were devoted to what is still called "free enterprise." These folks held the belief, already outmoded in the 20s [45], that the free market was the best way to organize society. If people could choose what they did and did not want to learn or buy from competitive offerings, then society would improve. Second, there were the social reformers. People like Eduard Lindeman and Jane Addams who saw informal adult ed within the framework of social action often aided by the government. One of the few points these two groups could agree on was that participation was and should be voluntary. The free market is based on the belief that people are free to choose. Social action programs depended on voluntary participation. [46] But today giant multinational corporations and huge government bureaucracies control much of our lives. [47] The link called "voluntary" between free market and social reform adult educators no longer exists, but the rhetoric lingers on. Free market liberals are now caught in the dead end of wanting to pour federal money on educational programs while the budget shrinks and economic growth stops. Social reformers find the government uncongenial to their approach and cast about for new allies to meld adult ed

and worthwhile social action. The loss of the link between these two groups contributes to the split between the Orthodox and MLC worlds of adult education.

XXIII. In 1973, beset by some of the contradictions I've just mentioned and other even more personal ones I haven't, I quit my secure faculty position at Ohio State to go to Madison, Wisconsin, where I've been ever since. For a year I was visiting professor at the University of Wisconsin-Extension. Since then, I've made my living working part-time as a clerk in a library while being active as an adult educator in alternative broadcasting; community, political, university, therapeutic and religious groups; and since 1977 with Basic Choices, a non-profit center for clarifying political and social options. [48]

XXIV. One sad fact about adult education - Orthodox and Mutual Learner Centered - is that it is sometimes several years, if not decades, behind those groups which are on the leading edge of society. As I reviewed the literature on adult education for this talk, I noticed that one view still predominates: Scientific and technical progress is so rapid these days that adults must keep studying to catch up, and then only temporarily. It is this view that forms much of the basis for what I call the "professional adult education movement." I call it a movement, even though many of its adherents avoid that term because of its implications about working for liberal or radical change left over from the 60s. It is a movement because it is a group of dedicated people with a body of coherent beliefs working together toward a common end -- the professionalization of the field [49] But this movement may be left behind unless it begins to shift away from scientific and technical progress. Such scientism and technological optimism may be losing a little of the support they both enjoyed even among scientists and technocrats. The social irresponsibility of conventional science and high technology may be slowly becoming a little more apparent to more citizens. Nuclear weapons, nuclear power, super-high technology mainly in the service of corporate and military values are the prime examples. A few scientists are beginning to look for new paradigms, new approaches that at the outset take into consideration human and spiritual values. [50] Some technocrats are getting involved in technologies of personal, social, and spiritual transformation. [51] When words begin to lose their social status as "science" and "technology" appear to be, there are two ways to deal with the problems presented. Those who are devoted to the terms look for fresh and better meanings. Others, including me, who never felt comfortable with the terms in the first place, seek other concepts to emphasize. What is surprising today is that both types may be converging toward a common goal - the recognition that economic values and the importance of efficiency are secondary to more transcendent views of what is worth doing. There lies a small smidgen of hope among a few others on an otherwise forbidding horizon. What these transcendental values are is still very vague, but certainly they include those Michael Marien points to: decentralization, ecological and mutual self-reliance, appropriate technology - all leading to harmony with the environment. [52] And they include the approaches to adult learning these goals imply. Also they mean getting beyond the quality R.H.Tawney noted over 60 years ago which demoralizes the social order with excessive riches/excessive poverty. [53]

As we search for clearer definitions and more effective strategies, we can begin to challenge the present authoritarian structure and work toward more fully human relations with each other. We can build on the immense resources of vitality and creativity that a more humane democratic tradition still offers us. If we have learned anything in adult education, it is the

fundamental importance of personal and group activities that are fulfilling in themselves. Life cannot be delegated! [54]

REFERENCES:

1. Kurt Vonnegut, Jr. God Bless You, Mr. Rosewater or Pearls Before Swine. New York: Dell, 1965. p. 88. A similar form of adult education that is becoming more "marketable" these days might be labeled "pseudo-slurping lessons" for those who want to get close to the Money River but still live some distance way. See, for instance, Lee Mitgang's article for the Associated Press, "Upwardly Mobile Get Tips: Psst! Want to be a Jet-setter?" The Capital Times (Madison, WI), October 5, 1982, p. 17. "Just a few limousine lengths from the glitter of Fifth Avenue, 23 people sipped champagne as they spent an evening learning how to move up in life - to high society... The two-hour class was sponsored by Network for Learning, a three-year-old company that sells adult education courses in New York and Houston." Or: Marcia Millman, "Prosperity Training: Hope for the Greedy?" Ms. Magazine, October 1982, pp.75-79. Describes some new popular Prosperity Training Workshops and Seminars. Tuition ranges from \$60 for two evenings to \$300 for a three-day program "modeled on a program by Leonard Orr, a California-based New Age guru, best known for developing a therapeutic breathing technique called 'rebirthing' ... Orr's method borrows from a 1937 best-selling book, Think and Grow Rich by Napoleon Hill, which reassured Depression-era readers that all achievements and earned riches spring from positive thinking, something that is freely created and available to anyone." Good luck! Perhaps the Prosperity Training students could save their tuition by reading one line from George Bernard Shaw: " My method of education is to teach people how to laugh at themselves," New York Times, April 13, 1924.
2. Flying on Air Canada to the first of these speaking engagements in Vancouver, I was handed a "menu" by the flight attendant for the meal she was about to serve. It contained a handsome reproduction of a bird called the Marsh Hawk (Circus Cyaneus) with this description, which I thought set the tone for the speech I was about to deliver: "In the spring the male Marsh Hawk can sometimes be observed climbing almost vertically to perhaps a height of twenty-five metres from the ground. From there, he then arcs up again to repeat the maneuver as many as seventy times."
3. Michael Harrington. The Other America: Poverty in the United States. New York: Macmillan, 1962.
4. Phyllis M. Cunningham, Lyn Peterson & Jack Ross. Compass: A Resource Directory. DeKalb, IL: National Alliance for Voluntary Learning, 1982. An invaluable 200 item "resource directory (65 pp.) of programs and people committed to and working on liberatory and voluntary advocacy adult education." Includes a list of 50 selected readings. On this trip, I also spent some time with Warren Ziegler (Futures-Inventions Associates) who spends much of his time helping people in the Orthodox world of adult education and other institutions fine alternate paths. He has prepared a worthwhile set of ten "mindbooks" (e.g. Mindbook for the Citizen-Leader, Mindbook for Imaging a World Without Weapons) for such groups and has recently prepared a paper, "The Quest for a Fully Human Policy for the Education of Adults," which is well worth getting. It appears in Policy Issues and Process: Issues in Education for Adults, #1 edited by Gene Whaples and Bill Rivera. College Park, MD: University of Maryland, Department of Agricultural & Extension Education, 1982. In it Warren suggests a series of new public policies (e.g. "the removal of educational credentials from all lists of criteria used by any part of the

social structure to do anything at all to any person, actively or passively. The federal government could begin by removing educational credentials (or certified levels of attainment) from its civil service entrance examinations.")

5. Michael Marien, "The Two Post Industrialism and Higher Education," World Future Society Bulletin, XVI:3, May-June 1982, pp. 13-28. **Updated Contact info as of 2006:** 7910 Woodmont Avenue, Suite 450, Bethesda, Maryland 20814. Tel. 301-656-8274. E-mail info@wfs.org. Web site <http://www.wfs.org>. Also inquire from WFS about rates for Marien's monthly abstract of many articles & books on future studies, Future Survey.

6. Michael Marien, Letter September 7, 1982 in which he enclosed the following chart especially prepared for us and based on Item #5 above:

The Two Post-Industrialisms and Adult Education

<p>"Post-Industrialism" "Post-Industrialism" Technological, Ecological, <u>Service Society</u> <u>Self-Reliant Society</u> Premises and The "Good Life" as affluence The "Good Life" as useful work, Promises and leisure; big technology peace, self-fulfillment, health; to solve problems; mastery appropriate technology; of environment harmony with environment Knowledge and Western science; established Non- Western science; integrative Skills Required disciplines and professions; studies (general systems theory,</p>	<p>as a as an</p>	<p>complex technology; "value- future studies); value-conscious- free approaches; specialist ness encouraged; more roles generalist roles Learning-Relevant Well-educated Information/ Acknowledged ignorant society Societal Self-Image Knowledge Society takes adult learning seriously Orientation of Profession-Oriented (seeks Learner-Oriented; concerned Adult Education to enhance Adult Education with all adult learning (especially as a profession); concerned "elites" with pressing learning</p>	<p>only with potential classroom needs) by any means, in any clients. location. Role of Adult Agent of school/university Facilitator, counselor, Education classroom model; supervisor provocateur, idea broker, of credits and credentials non-hierarchical leader View of Independent Ignored (except in programs Identified and encouraged Learning awarding credit) where appropriate Role of Institutional Increasingly mandatory, with Voluntary emphasis, with Learning emphasis on credits and stress on desirability of</p>
--	-----------------------	---	--

credentials; maintain same greater ratio of adults to

ratio of youth and adults youth, fewer degree programs

and widespread learning

sabbaticals

7. R.H. Tawney. The Acquisitive Society. New York: Harcourt, Brace & World, 1920.

8. Despite what you may have heard or read, I am not an anarchist. I'm a sometimes confused libertarian, fellowship, transformational, New Age, personalist, democratic socialist. If you want to get a better line on where I'm at, see the 255 item Radical Ideas in Adult Education "manifesto-bibliography. A well-expressed view of the invariably political form of any adult education activity was suggested for inclusion by Dan Beveridge: Gregory Baum, "Adult Education as a Political Enterprise," Learning (Canada), Fall/Winter 1979, pp.9-10+. Baum analyzes the liberal, conservative, and socialist models of adult education in Canada.

9. Bruce Woll. "The Victim Freud, Second

Thoughts, 4:4, August 1982, p.5.

10. Bruno Bettelheim, "Reflections: Freud and the Soul," The New Yorker, March 1, 1982, pp.52+.

11. "No Comment: Looking at the Bright Side," The Progressive, 46:10, October 1982, p. 14. "From the annual report of Forum Group, Inc., a corporation that once sold auto body parts and now operates hospitals." Progressive is the best source for keeping up with the horrors of the present society and occasionally even offers some positive suggestions for getting beyond them. The latest adult ed related example of the former is in the "No Comment" section of the November 1982 issue, p. 13: "There Will Be a Final Exam." "Adult evening courses offered by the Danbury, CT public schools (at \$30 each) include Astrology, Basic Upholstery, Cake Decorating, Chair Caning, and Surviving Nuclear War." For rates or possibly a sample issue, write The Progressive, 409 E. Main St., Madison, WI 53703 (address is correct as of 3/2006). The Milton Mayer columns are worth the subscription price all by themselves. Progressive is one of my two favorite magazines. It offers the

most politically thought-provoking materials while the New York Review of Books is best for philosophical and literary stimulation. The problem with both is their titles. Anything with New York in the title bears the burden of that impossible city and Progressive conjures up the dominant images of Teddy Roosevelt, a mad scientist, or a front for a Stalinist group. I suggest a question mark after each title.

On the problems with the medical model, John McKnight, Center for Urban Affairs, Northwestern University, Evanston, IL, is best. See his latest "Health in the Post Medical Era," in his book, The Mask of Love, Salem NH: Marion Boyars, Inc. 1984 or his chapter in Disabling Professions, Salem, NH: Marion Boyars, Inc. 1977. See also Ivan Illich's Medical Nemesis, NY: Pantheon, 1976.

12. Richard M. Alpert, "Professionalism and Educational Reform," Journal of Higher Education, 51:5, 1980, pp. 496-518. Materials on professionalism used for this talk also include: Mark Battle and others, "Professionalism: Weighed and Found Wanting?"

Public Welfare, Summer 1981, pp. 4-9.
Mike Fores and Ian Glover, "The British Disease: professionalism," The Times Higher Education Supplement (London), Feb. 24, 1976, p. 15.
Marie R. Haug, "Deprofessionalization: An Alternate Hypothesis for the Future," Sociological Review, Monograph #20, Dec. 1973, pp. 195-211.
Thomas W. Heaney. "The Professionalization of Adult Education," whole special issue of Setting the Pace, 1:3, Jan. 1981. Includes five thoughtful articles and a helpful 60 item quotational bibliography.
Ivan Illich. Toward a History of Needs. NY: Pantheon, 1977. Especially the essay, "Useful Unemployment and Its Professional Enemies."
Ivan Illich and others. Disabling Professions. Salem, NH: Marion Boyars, Inc. 1977.
John McKnight, "The Professional Problem," Grantsmanship Center News, Jan-Feb 1981.
John Ohliger. "Professionalization of Clergy: Pros and Cons," 10 page talk presented to 1975 Clergy-Land Grant University Conference, Madison, WI. Includes a 50 item bibliography and is

my first attempt to deal at length with professionalism.
Martin Oppenheimer. "The Proletarianization of the Professional," Sociological Review, Monograph #20, Dec. 1973, pp. 213-227.
Nicholas A. Sharp. "Credentialing Adult Educators," Adult Leadership, October 1976, pp.40+
Anselm Strauss & Rue Bucher. "Professions in Process," American Journal of Sociology, 66:5. Jan. 1961, pp.325-334.
Nina Toren, "Deprofessionalization and its Sources," Sociology of Work and Occupations, 2:4, Nov. 1975, pp.323-337.
13. R. Wiebe. The Search for Order: 1877-1920. New York: Hill & Wang, 1967. p. 121.
14. Daniel J. Czitrom. Media and the American Mind: From Morse to McLuhan. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1982. And see my review of it in Lifelong Learning::the Adult Years.
15. Christopher Lasch. "Mass Culture Reconsidered," Democracy, Oct 1981, pp.7-22.
16. International Commission on the Development of Education. Learning to Be:

The World of Education Today and Tomorrow. Paris: UNESCO, 1972. For critiques of this report see: Martin, Carnoy, "Learning to Be: Consensus and Contradictions," Convergence, 7:#, 1974, pp.53-60. John Ohliger. "Is Lifelong Education a Guarantee of Permanent Inadequacy?" Convergence, 7:2, 1974, pp. 47-59.
17. David Lisman & John Ohliger. "Must We All Go Back to School?" The Progressive, 42:10, October 1978, pp. 35-37.
18. Albert Quie. "The Challenge of Lifelong Learning," Adult Leadership, December 1972, pp. 182-4+.
19. L. Steven Zwerling. "Adult Education: Breeder of Inequality?" The New York Times, Summer Survey of Education: Section 12), August 22, 1982, p.49. A very thoughtful and critical piece. Sam Brightman in the September 20, 1982 issue of his newsletter, Adult & Continuing Education Today: "In succinct and challenging form, Zwerling has raised issues that have troubled me and many adult educators. I was curious as to what New York University (of which Zwerling is Acting Dean of Continuing Education)

might be doing to address those issues, so I turned to page 5 of the supplement which contained an advertisement for the School of Continuing Ed of NYU. Here are some pertinent excerpts including this headline: 'The way to get the most out of life, is to learn more about it. Our free bulletin can show you how. Courses offered in the areas of Career Advancement, Academic Skills, Career Planning and Mind Enhancement included Electronic Publishing, Career Change Workshops, Reading Improvement and Art Styles Through the Ages.' There was a legendary drill sergeant in World War II boot camp who was fat and slovenly and dedicated to the task of instructing recruits. 'Don't do like I do,' he was wont to bellow. 'Do like I say!'"

In Canada an article in Maclean's (Canada's weekly newsmagazine), it was the cover story: Ann Walmsley, "The Mind Joggers: The Race to Keep Up," 95:32, August 9, 1982, pp. 30-34, contains this criticism by Ian Morrison, executive director of the Canadian Association for Adult Education, "the race to create educational opportunities has been

directed largely at middle-class consumers who already have high incomes and higher education." Lest anyone think merely increasing "opportunities" through expanded recruitment or scholarships & government aid for poor people will solve the "problem," read Daniel Wick's "Afterlife-Long Learning: Next on the Higher Education Agenda," Journal of Thought, 17:1, 1982, pp. 15, or Gerald Sussman's Over-Extension University Bulletin, NY: M. Evans, 1982 (excerpted in Penthouse, October 1982, pp. 50-52.)

20. Computer search conducted June 16, 1982. ERIC includes a large Canadian collection. Search showed that 20,273 docs dealt with "competence/accountability," 4,895 with "professions/professionalism," and 14,280 with "continuing/adult education." By reducing the search to only those docs dealing with all three concepts, we turned up 99 items. The latest publicity sheet indicates that ERIC has over 409,000 citations with approximately 3,500 added monthly."

21. Some of the more helpful or revealing docs on "competence/accountability"

y" from the ERIC search and other sources: Paul D. Carrington. "On the Pursuit of Competence," Trial Magazine, 12:12, December 1976, pp. 36+ "The pursuit of competence has some of the aspects of white whale hunting" unfettered by prudence, it can be harmful to the pursuer." Ethical and Economic Issues Newsletter, April 1979, 12 pp. ED 169 832. Dennis S. Falk and others. Perspectives on Health Occupational Credentialing. September 1979, ED 201 820. 113 pp. "Continuing competence is an area of increasing attention and controversy." Joseph Conella and Patrick Storey. "Continuing Medical Education and Clinical Competence," Continuing Education Newsletter (American Medical Association), "A feasible and acceptable method of determining competence does not now exist." April 1981. Paul G. Grussing. "Mandatory Public Relicensure Examinations: Alternatives and Recommendations," American Journal of Pharmaceutical Education, 43:3, August 1979, pp. 244-249. Quotes an unpublished paper by E. J. Van Meter: "As with

many of the jargon phrases of education, including accountability and planning, the term 'competency'...unfortunately, has as many meanings as there are people masquerading as 'experts' in the field...One of the major unresolved issues confronting adherents of the competency-based training movement is a lack of clear definitions for those concepts which are cornerstones of the subject."

Informing the Future: A Plan for Higher Education for the 80s. ED 200 138.

January 1981. "Pushed too far, accountability begins to conflict with institutional mission."

Parochka, Jacqueline and others. Continuing Education and the Relationship to the Profession.

ED 209 985. 11 pp. 1981.

Martha K. Piper and Robert W. Houston. "The Search for Teacher Competence," Journal of Teacher Education, 31:5, Sept-Oct 1980, pp.37-40.

"Unless there is a renewed effort by persevering educators to reach a consensus on what competency means to the teaching profession, the promise of the CBE movement will be as illusive as its terminology."

J. Stephen Sherwin. "Good Change, Bad Change, Changeless Change: or What Else is New and What's the Price?" ED 162 314, 1978, 16 pp.

"Accountability is an attractive idea --and seductive, too. It deserves inspection. I think we should start by asking to whom we are accountable and how the standard of accountability was decided upon. How broadly based is the standard and how widely supported? Or is it the idea of a few people who are in a position to impose it and are themselves unaccountable? I should like to know how good the instrument is which purports to measure our accountability edifice...I am troubled also by the factory model in the minds of the advocates of accountability (the) analogy between industry and education (in) the use of such terms as "product," "school management," "output," and "efficiency." Wisniewski, Richard. "Oklahoma's Quest for Quality," ED 200 541, February 1981. 7 pp. 22. J. Roby Kidd. "Prospects for the 80s," in Continuing Professional Education. Calgary: University of Calgary, 1980. 21 pp. "It's my opinion that unless some strong and effective

measures are taken, the profession will continue to be on trial." See ref. #12 for more.

23. See Alpert in ref. #12 and Grussing in ref. #21.

24. John R. Wikse. "Night-Rule: The Political Iconography of Dreams," unpublished paper presented to the American Academy of Psychoanalysis Conference on Psycho-analysis and the Social Sciences," May 1980. 22 pp. Wikse is a professor at Shimer College, Waukegan, Illinois.

25. Roger Boshier. "John Condliffe Confronts Captain Kirk: A New Zealand Perspective on Mandatory Adult Education During World War I," pp. 20-25 in Proceedings of the 23rd Annual Adult Education Research Conference. April 1982. Available from University of Nebraska-Lincoln, Department of Adult & Continuing Education. R.H. Tawney supported Condliffe in his struggle for voluntary adult education!

26. Here are some books which present the lives of adult educators whose actions often offer "adult education by example" in my view:

Cynthia Stokes Brown. Alexander Meiklejohn: Teacher of Freedom.

Berkeley: Meiklejohn Civil Rights Institute, 1981. A socialist, who was one of the last Presidents of the American Association for Adult Education and spent much of the last part of his life defending the First Amendment from the attacks of Red-baiters.

Leslie Fishbein. Rebels in Bohemia: The Radicals of the Masses-1911-1917. Chapel Hill: University of North Carolina Press, 1982. John Reed of "Reds" movie fame and others who lived at a time when cultural and political radicalism coincided.

William D. Miller. Dorothy Day: A Biography. New York: Harper & Row, 1981. The co-founder of the Catholic Worker movement.

Scott Nearing. The Making of a Radical: A Political Autobiography. New York: Harper & Row, 1972. A radical professor who, after being red-baited generations ago, went back-to-the-land long before the current movement there.

John Ohliger. "Accent on Social Philosophy," Adult Leadership, October 1973, p. 144. "A few weeks before he dropped dead recently, that great

conflict-oriented community developer, Saul Alinsky, made a speech...with some comments about Socrates as an example of what an educator should be: an 'outside agitator,' one who agitates people's minds. Some of his last words were 'Socrates was a troublemaker. And there are different names that all groups have for someone who is radical or moving that way toward becoming a gadfly. In the media they say "He is controversial." On the university campuses, "He has personality difficulties." In the field of religion, "He is lacking prudence."' By and large, the appeals of those of us who have urged adult educators to emulate Alinsky, or Socrates, or Christ, for that matter, by raising disturbing questions, have met with little response. We are told by those who profess to admire the Socratic dialogues that it was a waste of time to make waves. Those who call themselves 'Christians' say to us, 'Look how He ended up.' Even so."

Jo Ann Robinson. Abraham Went Out: A Biography of A. J. Muste. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 1982. The pacifist-socialist who

started one of the first labor colleges and inspired people like Martin Luther King, Jr.

Wallace Shawn and Andre Gregory. My Dinner with Andre: A Screenplay. New York: Grove Press, 1981. Anyone who has seen or heard of this excellent film about the travails of Andre will be interested in reading this views on adult learning from the introduction: "A few weeks ago, I had dinner with Twyla Tharp in her kitchen, and we were talking about the problems of the artist, or for that matter the individual, maturing in our society. Why do we have so few mature artists? Trying to answer this question, we began to speculate that your early years, say your twenties, should be all about learning --learning how to do it, then your next several years, say your thirties, should be all about telling the world with passion and conviction everything that you think you know about your life and art. Meanwhile, though, if you have any sense, you'll begin to realize that you just don't know very much -- you don't know enough. And so the next many, many years, we agreed, should be all about

questions, only questions, and that if you can totally give up your life and your work to questioning, then perhaps somewhere in your mid-fifties you may find some very small answers to share with others in your work. The problem is that our society (including the community of artists) doesn't have much patience with questions and questioning. We want answers, and we want them fast."

A related form of "adult-education-by-example" is offered in this quotation which forms the beginning for Duncan Campbell's Adult Education as a Field of Study and Practice. Vancouver: University of British Columbia, 1977. Paul A. Miller: "And, finally, we who are educators must recognize that what we do with our own lives will speak more loudly than what we say or try to do with our programs. If we aim to promote continuous learning, as an instrument for the fulfillment of an entire life, then we should be its best examples. If we believe that people should listen to their yearnings, then we should listen to our own. If we believe that learning, working, and leisuring should be intertwined, then we

should risk them and a life that binds them for ourselves." p. xi.

More people whose lives offer this form of adult education can be found listed in Radical Ideas in Adult Education, see. Ref. #8. Perhaps the simplest and best expression of the point of view here comes from the great socialist adult educator, Eugene Victor Debs, (who received almost a million votes for President of the U.S. while in prison for making a speech opposing World War I): "If I could be Moses leading you into the Promised Land, I would not do it, because then someone else could easily lead you out!"

27. George Orwell. Nineteen Eight-Four. New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1959. See the excellent biography by Bernard Crick, George Orwell. Boston: Little, Brown & Co., 1981. See also Irving Howe's Orwell's 1984: Text, Sources, Criticism. New York: Harcourt, Brace, World, 1963. For a view of what adult education might be like in 1984 from a 1971 perspective, see my "Adult Education: 1984," Adult Leadership, January 1971. 28. Ross Kidd & Krishna Kumar. "Co-opting Freire," Economic &

Political Weekly, Jan. 3-10, 1981.

29. For some of Illich's critiques of the concept of education and a dissertation that I supervised which analyzes them see:

Ivan Illich. "The Alternatives to Schooling," Saturday Review, June 19, 1971.

_____. "Education as Idol," Religious Education, Nov-Dec. 1971.

_____. "Education: A Consumer Commodity and a Pseudo-Religion," The Christian Century, Dec. 15, 1971.

_____. "Vernacular Values," in Shadow Work. Salem, NH: Marion Boyars, Inc., 1981. An earlier version with some additional material appeared in Teachers College Record, 81:1, Fall 1979.

_____. "Illich on Sex, Gender & Education," Second Thoughts, 4:2, January 1982, pp. 6-7. "I now think that I can say something about the 'inverse of education' - namely growth into gender. And thus I can explore some new points relating to the history of education: Homo Educandus comes into being as competence and knowledge deemed necessary for everyday life begin to be gender-neutral

- Genderless humans who are the subject of 'economics'." See also Gender: New York: Pantheon, January 1983. William Ideson Johnson. Hermetic Alchemy as the Pattern for Schooling Seen by Ivan Illich. Columbus: Ohio State University. Unpublished dissertation in the Department of Education, 1973. John Ohliger & Filip Von Moen. "Illich after Deschooling," Learning Connection, Fall 1982. 700 words reviewing everything Illich has written since Deschooling Society.

30. Raimundo Panikkar. "A Philosophy of Liberation," Cross Currents, Winter 1980-81, pp. 454-5. An essay-review on Enrique Dussel's Filosofía de la Liberación. Mexico City, Editorial Edicol, S.A., 1977. "The first task of a philosophy of liberation is to liberate philosophy itself." Art Lloyd suggests an additional source that may help with the question of different concepts of knowledge: Martin Buber. "God and the Spirit of Man," in Eclipse of God. New York: Harper & Row, 1952. Helen Modra suggests a book which also deals with the fundamental problems encountered here" Walter

A. Weisskopf. Alienation and Economics. New York: E.P. Dutton & Co, Inc. 1971.

31. *Bill Kemsley was involved in labor education and political work in Vermont at the time this was written.*

32. *Paul Sheats was Professor Emeritus at UCLA and active in adult education circles at the time this was written.* Abbott Kaplan passed away after spending the last portion of his life as President of the SUNY campuses in New York State.

33. Quoted without attribution in my "Prospects for a Learning Society," Adult Leadership, Sept. 1975, pp.37-39. This was one of the articles for the 25th anniversary of the founding of the AEA. One paragraph of this article was removed by the publishers without knowledge of the (Black) editor of the special issue: "It is common talk that while a well-known Black adult educator is imprisoned for misappropriating a few thousand \$\$\$ of federal funds, another equally well-known white adult educator misappropriates many thousands more but is permitted to resign and

take a similar position in another state."

On this trip I learned that Roger Boshier at the University of British Columbia has many hours of taped interviews with Coolie Verner that he is just awaiting the free time to turn into an interesting monograph or article.

34. R.H. Tawney. Religion and the Rise of Capitalism: A Historical Study.

London: John Murray, 1926. The best source of information on Tawney is an excellent biography by Ross Terrill, R.H. Tawney and His Times: Socialism as Fellowship. London: Andre Deutsch, 1974. In preparation for this talk, I wrote to Terrill (now a Professor of Government at Harvard University) to find out if there was something more recent than his book. He replied, "There's a study, Tawney, Galbraith, and Adam Smith [by David Reisman, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1982.] Also, there is a small book from Student Christian Movement Press - United Kingdom. 35. For publishing information, see Ref. #7.

36. For the professionalism materials used, see Ref. # 12.

37. See also my review of Houle's The Design of Education (San Francisco:

Jossey-Bass, 1972) in *Adult Leadership*, Sept. 1973, p. 117.

38. Wat Dickerman retired in the mid-60s. Web Cotton gathered tributes to him from former students and colleagues from all over the world and presented them to him -- a fine basis for anyone wishing to do a further study on Wat as a "model" of graduate work in adult ed.

39. On this trip, I learned that Gordon Campbell has been a professor at the University of Lethbridge, Lethbridge, Alberta, Canada, ever since he left Selkirk. I understand that he has either written a book or is at work on one about community colleges and about his experiences at Selkirk. I was informed by others on this trip that quite a few community colleges started out with the same "community" ideals as Selkirk, but that all or most of them have either become extensions of high school, technical institutes, or part of the regular university system.

40. See my "Integrating Continuing Education," *Journal of Higher Education*, XL:7, Oct. 1969, pp.555-561. It contains my description of our attempts at Selkirk to make adult education an integrated part of the

college and the community. I would do that article quite differently today based on 20/20 hindsight. When I went to Selkirk, Professor Jack London (University of California-Berkeley) suggested that I keep a journal of my experience there. I kept a taped diary which was transcribed by my secretary there (who was fired when I left, for her association with these views?) into a 225 page manuscript. I submitted it to several publishers, who found it interesting but felt it fell between the cracks of a trade or text book.

The closest it got to publication was at Syracuse University Press, who submitted it to their lawyers and were informed, "Well, you would win the libel suit."

41. (*At the time this article was written*): The most recent address I have for Buddy DeVito (1967) is 1316 Lookout St, Trail, British Columbia, Canada.

42. Frank Adams. "Education in the Shoe Shop," in Ronald Gross, editor. *Invitation to Lifelong Learning*. Chicago: Follett, 1982. Originally published in the magazine, *The Radical Teacher*, in 1977 as "Learning and Change in the Shoe Shop." Frank Adams is also the author of

Unearthing Seeds of Fire: the Idea of Highlander.

Winston-Salem, NC: John F. Blair, Publisher, 1975.

43. I have been writing about Mandatory Continuing Education (MCE) since 1968 ("Accent on Social Philosophy: Lifelong Learning --Voluntary or Compulsory?" *Adult Leadership*, Sept. 1968. My most recent effort is "Comment on Continuing Education for Professionals: Voluntary or Mandatory?" *The Journal of Higher Education*, 53:5, Sept.-Oct 1982, pp.593-599. It contains references to materials with over 500 items on MCE and is an attempt to lay out briefly the historical, economic-technical, epistemological, and comprehensive contexts for the "raging debate" over MCE. In an article I submitted at the request of the editor of UNESCO's journal, *Prospects*, ("Reconciling Education with Liberty," 28 pp.), I attempt to lay out the issues in a more international context.

On the trip while passed through Albuquerque, New Mexico, the daily newspaper, *The Albuquerque Tribune* (Oct. 6, 1982) had this headline on the front page across the top: "Woman

Sentenced to College, Not Prison." It was an Associated Press dispatch filed from Carlsbad, NM, starting, "An Artesia woman convicted of shooting her husband has been sentenced to college by a district judge who says it's cheaper to send a person to school than to prison." See also Newsweek, "American Graffiti: Sentenced to College," Oct. 18, 1982, p. 42. Another front page headline in the same newspaper when linked with the above seemed to capture the dilemma of excessive riches/excessive poverty the talk deals with: "Food Aid Cuts Proposed for Elderly, Children." It was over a story out of Washington about federal plans to cut food stamp benefits for elderly and eliminate meal subsidies to orphanages and other residential institutions for child care. To keep up with the developments on MCE and its relation to other issues, see Second Thoughts (*Basic Choices newsletter at the time this article was written*). For this talk, the following references were especially useful:

Thomas W. Heaney, editor. Task Force Report. Washington, AEA/USA Task Force, 1980. 25 pp. Contains

eight articles on Voluntary Learning and the MCE issue including a long bibliography. Available from AEA/USA, 810 18th St., NW, Washington, DC 20006.

Christine McGuire. "Issues in the Assessment of Continuing Professional Competence," 17 pp. paper presented to American Educational Research Association Conference, 1979. ED 171 788.

"Continuing Education for teachers, described by some as "the worst of any continuing education for the last forty years.' ... The view that education is the panacea for maintaining competence is based on the assumption that knowledge deficits, especially those concerned with new developments, are the major cause of inadequate performance on the part of practicing professionals... Mandated continuing education courses should not be used to ascertain professional competence...."

John Ohliger. "Dialogue on MCE," Lifelong Learning: The Adult Years, 4:10, June 1981, pp. 5-7+. Includes a long bibliography.

John Ohliger. "Must We All Go Back to School?" talk delivered to Minnesota Education Association Convention,

Oct. 1981. 11 pp. Includes a long bibliography.

Samuel Pearlman. "Evaluation Issues in Continuing Education," 9 pp., paper presented to American Psychological Association Convention, 1977. ED 149 215. "A careful regulation of continuing education procedures... will hopefully... avoid the risks of meaningless and deceitful educational efforts.... There is no probative evidence indicating a significant positive relationship between continuing education and competency. In a sense, therefore, it is within reason to think of MCE as a public palliative, useful in soothing and relieving public pressure on the profession."

Christopher Wellisz. "Professionals Debate Value of Brush-Ups," New York Times, Education Supplement, August 22, 1982, pp. 12 & 46. Contains the latest chart prepared by Louis Phillips on MCE for 16 professions and quotes him as saying, "There has been very little evaluation that has shown that continuing education makes a difference. It is one of those things that has been accepted without proof."

World Health Organization. Continuing

Education of Health Personnel. Copenhagen: WHO, 1977. 30 pp. ED 155 368. "In all Eastern European countries, continuing education is obligatory for health workers."

44. For more on "volunteerism" see my UNESCO draft listed in Ref #43 above and two articles in recent Second Thoughts, "Dracula at the Bloodbank," May 1982 & "The Needy Servicing the Greedy," August 1982. Also check out the lengthy Opposition to Volunteerism: An Annotated Bibliography by Doris Gold. June 1979, 21 pp. Available from CPL Bibliographies, 1313 East 60th St., Chicago, IL 60637.

45. Karl Polanyi. The Great Transformation. New York: Rinehart & Co., 1944.

46. Michael Day, now the professor of adult education at the University of Wyoming-Laramie, says he found some evidence to support my idea about why the term "voluntary" is so strong in adult ed jargon as he prepared his dissertation: Adult Education as a New Educational Frontier" Review of the Journal of Adult Education 1929-1941. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan,

unpublished doctoral dissertation in Education, 1981. 273 pp.

47. See the collective Basic Choices statement (not individually prepared as incorrectly attributed): "Adult Education Forum: The Social Uses of Theorizing in Adult Education," Adult Education, 31:1, Fall, 1980, pp.48-53.

48. At the time this paper was written: Write Basic Choices for more information about us and our work. As of 2006: contact us via cwagner@johnohlinger.org.

49. The literature on "movements" is vast and often contradictory. A few of the many articles and books I explored and found somewhat helpful include: Russell L. Curtis and Louis A. Zurcher, Jr. "Social Movements: An Analytical Exploration of Organizational Forms," Social Problems, 1973, pp. 356-370.

Rudolph Heberle and Joseph Gusfield. "Social Movements," International Encyclopedia of Social Sciences, Volume 14. New York: Macmillan, 1968. pp. 438-452.

Robert H. Lauer. "Social Movements: An Interactionist Analysis," The Sociological

Quarterly, 13, Summer 1972, pp. 315-328.

Robert J. S. Ross.

"The Impact of Social Movements on a Profession in Process: Advocacy in Urban Planning," Sociology of Work and Occupations, 3:4, Nov, 1976, pp. 429-454.

50. Fritjof Capra. The Tao of Physics: An Exploration of the Parallels Between Modern Physics and Eastern Mysticism. New York: Bantam Books, 1977.

Fritjof, Capra. The Turning Point: Science, Society and the Rising Culture. New York: Simon and Schuster, 1982.

Suggested by Jerry Apps.

Freeman Dyson.

"The Argument from Design," pp. 245-253 in his Disturbing the Universe. New York: Harper & Row, 1979.

Suggested by Tim Turner/

Thomas Heaney.

"Politics of Explanation: The Ongoing Human Quest for Power," 27 pp. paper presented to the Midwest Research Conference, DeKalb, Illinois, Oct 1982. See especially Section 2 on Knowledge in which he speaks of "the discovery of reciprocal causal processes in the hard sciences and an increasing emphasis on the subjective and

psychosocial dimensions of science." Heaney is in the College of Continuing Education, Northern Illinois University, DeKalb, IL 60115.

Bruce Holbrook.
The Stone Monkey: An Alternative Chinese-Scientific Reality. New York: William Morrow, 1981. As is the Sardar reference below, this citation is drawn from Michael Marien's Future Survey (July 1982), the best source for keeping up with developments on this theme (See Ref #5 for how to order): "Western science, from physics to social sciences, is based on a dead and deadening view of reality that transforms the world more negatively than positively... Several Western writers are, however, mentioned sympathetically; Fritoj Capra, Alfred Korzybbski, F.S.C. Northrup, Ludwig von Bertalanffy and Gary Zukav."

Roger S. Jones.
Physics as Metaphor. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1982. "An effort to embody consciousness and subjectivity within physics."

Magoroh Maruyama.
"Heterogenistics and Morphogenetics: Toward a New Concept of the

Scientific," Theory and Society, 5:1 (1978) pp. 75-96. Cited in Heaney paper above.

Magoroh Maruyama. "Hierarchists, Individualists and Mutualists: Three Paradigms among Planners. Futures, April 1974, pp. 103-113. During the trip, C.D. Ledgerwood, Access, 16930 114 Ave., Edmonton, Canada T5M 3S2, gave me a copy of this and other articles by Maruyama, who has apparently written a great deal on this theme. Ledgerwood finds his thoughts "both insightful and refreshing."

Ian I. Mitroff and R.H. Kilmann.
Methodological Approaches to Social Sciences: Intepreting Divergent Concepts and Theories. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass, 1978. Cited in Heaney above.

Theodore Roszak.
Person/Planet: The Creative Disintegration of Industrial Society. Garden City, NY: Anchor Press, 1978. See especially pp. 49-53.

Ziauddin Sardar.
"Why Islam Needs Islamic Science," New Scientist, April 1, 1982, pp. 25-28. From Michael Marien's citation in Future Survey (see Bruce Holbrook above): "Although three-

quarters of the Muslim world is under martial law and Muslim leaders are happily importing wasteful technology, the institutionalization of Islamic science can become an effective weapon in countering tyrannical science and technology and its social and political consequences."

Gary Zukav. The Dancing Wu Lu Masters: An Overview of the New Physics. New York: Bantam New Age Books, 1980. Suggested by Warren Ziegler.
51. Marilyn Ferguson. The Aquarian Conspiracy. Los Angeles: J.P. Tarcher, 1980.

Theodore Roszak.
Unfinished Animal: The Aquarian Frontier and the Evolution of Consciousness. New York: Harper and Row, 1975.

Michael Wyatt.
New Age Socialism: Integrating Emotional, Spiritual and Social Liberation. Chicago: new Age Publishing Center, 1981. Marilyn Ferguson recommends this and says, "In this scholarly but practical little book, the author has tried to heal the rift between two worlds: humanistic transpersonal psychology and leftist political action." (At time this was written): Mike and

I have been involved for several months in a group that meets weekly in an attempt to examine the problems of restoring the dimension of feelings to left political life. We explore our feelings about ourselves and each other in a political context in this Personal/Political group. On this trip, I discovered that other political groups are engaged in similar searches.

52. See refs. #5 and #6 above.

53. See ref. #7 above.

54. The thoughts in the final paragraph are based in part on material from the writings of Ivan Illich and Lewis Mumford, for example:

Ivan Illich and others. After Deschooling, What? New York: Harper & Row, 1973.

"Deschooling will only be a displacement of responsibility to other kinds of administration so long as teaching and learning remain sacred activities separate and estranged from fulfilling life."

Lewis Mumford. "Authoritarian and Democratic Technics," in Melvin Kranzberg and William H. Davenport, eds., Technology & Culture: An Anthology. New York: New American Library, 1975. Most of

Mumford's stuff is too hard for me to get into, but this is straightforward and good.

During this trip I spent some time with Gerry Hanberry in New Mexico. Gerry was responsible for giving a lot of us in adult education our first "hands-on" experience in exploring the futures approach to our field through the National Think Tank on the Future of Adult Education that he organized with a grant from the U.S. Office of Education back in 1974. The regional and national conferences he arranged were exciting and fruitful experiences for many of us. The Orwellian year 1984 approaches, and it will then be ten years since the Futures Think Tanks met. It seems to me it would be a very good time to get some of the hundreds of adult educators together who were participants in these conferences to re-examine what we thought might or should happen back then. Along with some new participants, we might then ask what 1984 is really like and where we might go from there. If enough people write to Gerry (SunRise Springs, RR #2, Box 203, Santa Fe (La Cienega), NM 87501) and

endorse this idea with offers of assistance, maybe it will happen. I hope so.

"The tygers of wrath are wiser than the horses of instruction."

-- William Blake